



報告書

2007年11月15日

弁護士 二 関 辰 郎



日韓会談の相手方であった韓国では、本件文書に対応する韓日協定外交文書が韓国の情報公開法に基づいて2005年に全面開示されており、何人でも自由に当該文書を入手できるようになっている。そして、外務省がいったん不開示とし訴訟提起後に不開示を撤回した第4次会談の記録文書（甲第8号証の枠で囲った部分。以下「外務省不開示情報」という。）には、不開示処分当時すでに韓国の情報公開法に基づいて現実に入手できる文書（以下「韓国側情報」という。）と同一内容の文書が多数含まれていた。本報告書に資料として添付した文書は韓国側情報の一部の写しであるが、同一内容の文書が多数含まれていることを、両国の情報公開法で入手できた文書に基づいて具体的に对比して明らかにする。

(ア) 同一議事要旨の韓国における公開

日韓会談では、議事録の作成方法について両国で相互に内容確認をしていた。そのため、両国の議事録の内容は同一であるか、少なくとも著しく類似したものになっていたことが当初から予想されていたが、外務省が開示した情報（甲8の1～13）（以下「外務省情報」という。）と韓国側情報（資料1～9）を実際に対比してみると、日本と韓国の両国の国名や氏名が記載される場合に、日本側議事録では日本側が先に記載されているのに対し、逆に韓国側議事録では韓国側が先に記載されているという形式的違いが存するだけであり、後は一言一句違わない場合が原則であることが判明した。

具体的には以下のとおりである。

a 概要会議録（Summary Record）の作成方法に関する合意

日韓会談第四次会談本会議では、会議録の作成方法について、次のように合意がなされた。

「日韓双方は各々本会議に関する概要会議録の起草担当官を指名する。

概要会議録は指名された担当官が交互に英文で起草する。かくして起草された概要会議録は双方の担当官によりイニシアルされて後、双方の首席代表による確認のため次の本会議に提出される。」(第2回会合会議録・甲8の2、2枚目(ハ))

そして、実際に、第4回会合において、「本会議会議録起草担当者(日本側大隈代表、韓国側崔代表)がイニシアルした本会議第2回会合及び第3回会合に関する概要会議録が両国首席代表によって確認され」(甲8の4、二(1))、第5回会合において「大隈代表及び崔代表がイニシアルを了した本会議第4回会合の概要録の確認が行なわれた」(甲8の5、二(1))というように、次の本会議あるいは次々回の本会議において内容確認が行なわれていたのである(なお、外務省情報上、第1回会合に関する概要会議録の取扱いは不明であるが、韓国側情報には第1回会合の概要会議録(Summary Record)も含まれている。資料1)。

b 具体例

上記のような議事録の作成方法がとられた結果、外務省情報と韓国側情報を対比してみれば、以下の表に示すように外務省不開示情報とされた概要会議録は、すべて韓国側情報に含まれていたことが明らかである(なお、外務省情報の概要会議録は複数の場所に存在するので、それをすべてあげている)。

概要会議録	外務省情報	韓国側情報
第1回会合概要会議録	開示対象に含まれず。	資料1
第2回会合概要会議録	甲8の2の14-17頁、甲8の4の3-6頁	資料2
第3回会合概要会議録	甲8の4の8-9頁、同15-16頁	資料3
第4回会合概要会議録	甲8の4の13-14頁、甲8の5の3-4頁	資料4
第5回会合概要会議録	甲8の5の8-9頁、甲8の6の3-4頁	資料5
第6回会合概要会議録	甲8の6の8-10頁、甲8の7の4-6頁	資料6
第7回会合概要会議録	甲8の7の11-13頁、甲8の9の3-5頁	資料7

第8回会合概要会議録	甲8の8の14-16頁、甲8の9の7-9頁	資料8
第9回会合概要会議録	甲8の9の12-13頁	資料9

たとえば、第4回会合に関する概要会議録（英文）は、外務省情報では甲8の5「別添1号」（甲8の4の13-14頁、甲8の5の3-4頁）であり、韓国側情報では資料4である。

これを見ればわかるとおり、まず表題において、外務省情報では、「第四次日韓全面会談」（The Fourth Japan-Korea Overall Talks）となっているのに対し、韓国側情報では、「第四次韓日全面会談」（The Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks）となっており、国名の順序が入れ替わっている。次に会議出席者（2.Conferees）欄において、外務省情報では先に日本代表（Japanese Delegates）が記載されており、次に韓国代表（Korean Delegates）が記載されているのに対し、韓国側情報では、逆に韓国代表が先に記載され、次に日本代表が記載されている。同様に、議事要旨（3.Proceedings）欄の（1）では、外務省情報では、日韓（Japan-Korea）、「大隈及び崔」（Mr. Okuma and Mr. Choi）と日本側が先に記載されているのに対し、韓国側情報では、韓日（Korea-Japan）、「崔及び大隈」（Mr. Choi and Mr. Okuma）と韓国側が先に記載されている。

これらの点を除くと、第4回会合の概要会議録は、外務省情報と韓国側情報で一言一句違わない。

全く同じことが、上記の表のように第2回会合概要議事録から第9回会合概要議事録にも妥当する（但し、第3回会合概要議事録に関する韓国側情報資料3は標題部分が存在しないが、内容は同様である）。

このように、大半の場合において、原不開示部分に含まれる概要会議録（Summary Record）と韓国側情報とでは、日韓か韓日かという形式的記載順序を除けば、一言一句同一の関係にあった。

以上

資料 1

Tokyo, April 15, 1958

SUMMARY RECORD
1st PLenary Session
FOURTH KOREA-JAPAN OVERALL TALKS

0120

1. Time and place: 10:30 a.m. to 11:05 a.m. on April 15, 1958 at the Japanese Foreign Office.

2. Conference:

The Korean side : Ambassador Ben C. Limb
Ambassador Yu Taik Kim
Minister Tai Ha Yiu
Mr. Ho Lee
Counsellor Myu Hak Choi
Consul-General Chai Hang Ho
First Secretary Pil Shik Chin
Mr. Seo Yung Whang
Mr. Yung Mya Kang, Asia Section
Chief of the Foreign Ministry
Messrs. Ki Bong Han, Won Dal Lee
and To Kyong Limb

The Japanese side : Mr. Hense Sawada, Chief Delegate,
Delegates: Messrs. Yamajiro
Inoue, Yujiro Isaki, Kenta Hirayama,
Wataru Okuma, Osamu Itagaki,
Takichi Takano, Keijiro Shoji,
Kenjiro Nishimura, Kazuo Awasawa
Assistant Members: Messrs. Shinzo Hasegawa,
Teyakichi Akagawa, Minoru Imai,
Kiyoshi Suganuma, Yoshihiko Iseda,
Osamu Honda, Motoi Tachikawa,
Masamichi Nakamura, Masamobu Yabe,
Toshiro Yoshida.

3. Proceedings:

a). Mr. Sawada, Chief Delegate of the Japanese side, introduced the members of the Japanese delegation to the Korean delegation.

b). Ambassador Limb, Chief Delegate of the Korean side, introduced the members of the Korean delegation to the Japanese side.

c). Mr. Sawada, Chief Delegate of the Japanese side, made an address. (A copy of his address is attached hereto.)

d). Ambassador Limb, Chief Delegate of the Korean side, made an address. (A copy of his address is attached hereto.)

e). Decision of the date for next session.

/Mr. Sawada

5

MR. SAWADA:

The Japanese side proposed to hold the next plenary session on April 22, 1958.

AMB. LIMB:

The Korean side preferred April 21, 1958 to April 22, 1958.

MR. SAWADA:

April 21 is Monday, and April 20 is Sunday. We would like to have Monday for preparation for the second plenary session.

AMB. LIMB:

The Korean side accepted April 22, 1958 as the date for second plenary session.

AMB. LIMB:

What time shall we meet on April 22, 1958?

MR. SAWADA:

How about 10:30 a.m. on April 22, 1958?

AMB. LIMB:

No objection.

f). Press release.

The both sides agreed to release the following statement after the adjournment of the first plenary session of the fourth Korea-Japan overall talks.

"The first plenary session of the Korea-Japan Overall Talks was held at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs at 10:30 a.m., on April 15, 1958. The Korean delegation was headed by Mr. Son G. Limb and the Japanese delegation was headed by Mr. Renzo Sawada. At this meeting the Chief Delegates of the two Governments delivered opening addresses after having introduced the members of their respective delegations. It was decided also that the second plenary session be held on April 22, 1958."

g). The first plenary session of the fourth Korea-Japan overall talks was adjourned at 11:05 a.m. on April 15, 1958.

- The end -

0121

6

Summary Record
of the Second Plenary Session of
the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks

0124

1. Date, time and place:

April 22 (Tuesday), 1958 10:40 - 11:02 A.M.
at Room 311, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conference:

Korean delegates MR. LIMB, Don G.
Mr. YIU, Tai Ha
Mr. LEE, Ho
Mr. CHOI, Kyu Han

Japanese delegates Mr. Rensu SAWADA
Mr. Takajiro INOUE
Mr. Yujiro ISEKI
Mr. Kenta HIRAGA
Mr. Wataru OKUMA
Mr. Fekichi TANAKA
Mr. Hajiro SHOJI
Mr. Kenjiro NISHIMURA
Mr. Kazuo AMARAWA

3. Proceedings:

(1) Mr. Limb and Mr. Sawada agreed that the agenda of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks would be the same as agreed on December 31, 1957.

(2) Regarding the procedural matters for the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks Mr. Limb and Mr. Sawada agreed on the following items:

(A) Language

The Korean side will use Korean or English and the Japanese side will use Japanese or English. Each side will provide its own translation service for comprehension of the languages spoken by the other side.

(B) Summary Record

Each side will designate one officer for drafting summary records on the meetings of the plenary sessions. The summary records will be drafted in English alternately by the designated officers. The summary records so drafted will be initialed by both officers and will be presented to the following plenary session for the confirmation by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

(C) Press release

Each side will designate one press officer. Joint press release will be made through the press officers upon decision by the Chief Delegates of both sides at the end of each plenary session.

9

(3) Mr. Limb proposed that for the smooth proceeding of the Overall Talks the following Committees and Sub-committees be organized:

- (A) Committee on Basic Relations
- (B) Committee on Korean Claims against Japan
 - (i) Sub-committee on Return of Vessels
 - (ii) Sub-committee on Return of Korean Art Objects.
 - (iii) Sub-committee on other Claims
- (C) Committee on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan
- (D) Committee on Fishery Problem and Peace Line

0125

Mr. Sawada said that the composition of committees had been discussed at the administrative level. Mr. Sawada also said that he would report the above proposal to his Government for consideration.

(4) It was agreed that the next plenary session be held at 4 p.m. April 25, 1953.

(5) Mr. CHOI, Kye Hah was designated by Mr. Limb as the officer responsible for drafting summary records and also as the press officer for the Korean side, and Mr. Wataru OKUMA was designated by Mr. Sawada to perform both functions for the Japanese side.

(6) The press release of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

- The end -

1. Date, time and place:

April 23 (Wednesday), 1958 4:25 - 4:35 p.m.
at Room 511, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conference:

The Korean delegates Mr. Son G. LIMB
Mr. Tai Ha YIU
Mr. Ho LEE
Mr. Kyu Bah CHOI

The Japanese delegates Mr. Ranse SAWADA
Mr. Takajiro INOUE
Mr. Tajiro ISEKI
Mr. Kenta NERAGA
Mr. Wataru OKUMA
Mr. Tokichi TAKANO
Mr. Keijiro SHOJI
Mr. Kenjiro NISHIKIURA
Mr. Kenso AWABAWA

3. Proceedings:

(A). In connection with the proposal which Mr. Limb made at the Second Plenary Session regarding the organization of committees and sub-committees, Mr. Sawada said that his Delegation was still studying over the Korean proposal in consultation with various Ministries concerned.

/ Mr. Limb

16

1614

0131

- 2 -

Mr. Limb expressed his hope that Mr. Sawada would give a prompt consideration to the Korean proposal so that actual works could be started at the earliest possible date.

(B). It was agreed that the Fourth Planary Session be held at 4 p.m. on April 25, 1955.

(C). The press release, of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

- The end -

17

0132

1615

Summary Record
of the Fourth Plenary Session of
the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks

1. Date, time and place:

April 25 (Friday), 1958 4:25 - 4:45 p.m.
at Room 511, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conference:

Korean Delegates Mr. LIMB, Ben C.
Mr. YIU, Tai HA
Mr. LEE, He
Mr. CHOI, Kyu Bah

Japanese Delegates Mr. Renzo SAWADA
Mr. Takajiro INOUE
Mr. Yujiro ISEKI
Mr. Kenta HYDAGA
Mr. Wataru OKUMA
Mr. Tokichi TAKANO
Mr. Keijiro SHOJI
Mr. Kenjiro NISHIMURA
Mr. Kazuo AWASAWA

3. Proceedings:

(1) The summary records of the second and third plenary sessions of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks, which had been respectively initialed by Mr. CHOI and Mr. OKUMA, were confirmed by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

(2) Mr. Sawada said that the Korean proposal on the composition of committee was still under the study of the Japanese Delegation. Mr. Limb expressed his hope that the study would be completed as promptly as possible so that both sides could start actual work immediately.

(3) It was agreed that the next plenary session be held at 3 p.m. April 30, 1958.

(4) The press release, of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

- The end -

0137

1620

77

**Summary Record
of the Fifth Plenary Session
of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks**

1. Date, time and place:

April 30 (Wednesday), 1958 5:15 p.m. - 8: 30 p.m.
at Room 311, Ministry of Foreign Affairs,
Japanese Government

2. Conference:

Korean Delegates

Mr. LIMB, Ben C.

Mr. YIU, Tai Ha

Mr. LEE, Ho

Mr. CHOI, Kya Hah

Japanese Delegates

Dr. Ranze SANADA

Mr. Takajiro INOUE

Mr. Yujiro ISHII

Mr. Kenta HIRAGA

Mr. Wataya OKUMA

Mr. Teiichi TAKANO

Mr. Keijiro SHOJI

Mr. Kazuo ARASAWA

3. Proceedings:

(1) The summary record of the Fourth Plenary Session of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks, which had been initialed by Mr. Choi and Mr. Okuma, was confirmed by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

30

0145

1628

(2) Dr. Sawada said that the Korean proposal on the composition of committees was still under study of the Japanese Delegation, and that he would try his best to give the Korean Delegation an answer in this regard by the next plenary session. Mr. Lim renewed his request that a prompt consideration be given to the Korean proposal so that the composition of committees could be completed at the next session.

(5) It was agreed that the next plenary session be held at 3 p.m. on May 6, 1952.

(4) The press release, of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

31

1629

0146

Summary Record
of the Sixth Plenary Session of
the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks

1. Date, Time and Place:

May 6 (Tuesday), 1958 3:10 - 3:20 p.m.
At Room 311, Ministry of Foreign Affairs,
Japanese Government

2. Conference:

Korean Delegates

Mr. LIM, Ben G.

Mr. YIU, Tai Ha

Mr. LEE, Ho

Mr. CHOI, Kye Nah

Japanese Delegates

Dr. Renzo SANADA

Mr. Takajiro INOUE

Mr. Yuziro ISHII

Mr. Kenta HIRAGA

Mr. Wataru OKUMA

Mr. Tokichi TAKANO

Mr. Eiji SHOJI

3. Proceedings:

(1) The summary record of the fifth plenary session, which had been initialled by Mr. Choi and Mr. Okuma, was confirmed by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

(2) Dr. Sawada proposed that the following Committees and Sub-committees be established, as a result of the study on the Korean proposal regarding the composition of committees:

- (i) Committee on Basic Relations
- (ii) Committee on Korean Claims
 - a. Sub-committee on Claims
 - b. Sub-committee on Vessels
- (iii) Committee on Fisheries and "Peace Line"
- (iv) Committee on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan

Mr. Limb stated that the above counter-proposal was acceptable.

(3) Dr. Sawada said that in connection with the names of committees he wished to add that they would not bring alteration to the matters as agreed at the time of conclusion of the Japan-Korea Preliminary Talks on December 31, 1957.

Mr. Limb stated that taking this opportunity he wished to express his hope that committee works be conducted smoothly and efficiently on the basis of the matters as agreed at the time of conclusion of the Korea-Japan Preliminary Talks on December 31, 1957.

41

1639

0156

(4) It was agreed that the next plenary session be held at 3 p.m. May 8, 1958.

(5) The press release, of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

42

1640

0157

COPY

Summary Record
of the Seventh Plenary Session of
the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks

0162

1. Date, time and place:

May 8 (Thursday), 1958 3:15 p.m. - 3: 50 p.m.
at Room 311, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conferees:

Korean Delegates

Mr. LIMB, Ben C.
Mr. YIU, Tai Ha
Mr. LEE, Ho
Mr. CHOI, Kyu "ah

Japanese Delegates

Dr. Renzo SAWADA
Mr. Takajiro INOUE
Mr. Yujiro ISEKI
Mr. Kenta HIRAGA
Mr. Wataru OKUMA
Mr. Tokichi TAKANO
Mr. Keijiro SHOJI

3. Proceedings:

(1) The summary record of the sixth plenary session of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks, which had been initiated by Mr. Choi and Mr. Okuma, was confirmed by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

(2) Dr. Sawada said that the Japanese side was ready for exchange of the list of its members of the committees if the Korean side was also ready. In this connection Mr. Limb said that he hoped that the exchange of the lists would be made at the next session as the preparation therefor was being made by the Korean side.

(3) Mr. Limb proposed that, for efficient proceeding of the works of committees, of the four committees, the Committee on Korean Claims and the Committee on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan start their works first, and that as to the works of the committee on Korean Claims, matters concerning Korean art objects and vessels be taken up first at the relevant sub-committees, pointing out that matters on Korean residents, Korean art objects and vessels had considerably been discussed in the past. Mr. Limb took the view that with a view to arriving at an earlier solution to the problems to be discussed at the Korea-Japan Talks, it would be more practical and efficient to start with easier problems, such as referred to above.

In this connection, having agreed to the principle that easier problems should be taken up first to expedite the works of committees, Dr. Sawada stated that without rejecting Mr. Limb's proposal, he wished that the Committee on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan would start its works in advance of those of the Committee on Korean Claims.

At this stage, it was agreed that further studies in this regard would be made for reaching an agreement at the next session.

(4) It was agreed that the next plenary session would

47

be held at 10:50 a.m. on May 12, 1958.

(5) The press release, of which the text is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

1010

48

1646

303

COPY

Summary Record
of the Eighth Plenary Session of
the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks

1. Date, time and place:

May 12 (Monday), 1958

10:45 - 11:05 a.m.

At Room 411, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conferees :

Korean Delegates

Mr. LIMB, Ben C.

Mr. YIU, Tai Ha

Mr. LEE, Ho

Mr. GHOI, Kyu Hak

Japanese Delegates

Dr. Renzo SAWADA

Mr. Takajiro INOUE

Mr. Yujiro ISEKI

Mr. Kenta HIRAGA

Mr. Wataru OKUMA

Mr. Tokichi TAKANO

Mr. Keijiro SHOJI

Mr. Kazuo AWASAWA

63

1660

0177

3. Proceedings:

(1) Both sides agreed on the following procedural matters for committee meetings:

(i) Languages:

As to the languages to be used at committee meetings, both sides will follow the decision made at the second plenary session in regard to the languages.

(ii) Summary Record:

When necessary, the joint summary record of committee meetings will be made upon the decision by the Chief Members of both sides at each meeting.

The summary record will be drafted in English and will be initialled by the Chief Members of both sides.

(iii) Press Release:

When necessary, press release on meetings of committees will be made upon the decision by the Chief Members of both sides at the end of each meeting.

Such press release will be made through the press officers of both sides designated at the second plenary session.

(2) Mr. Limb repeated his statement on the Korean proposal made at the seventh plenary session in regard to the measures for efficient proceeding of the works of committees.

In reply Dr. Sawada stated that though he thought that it would be an appropriate way of approach to start the works of the four committees at the same time, the Japanese Delegation

64

1661

0178

had no objection to starting first with the works of the Committee on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan and of the Committee on Korean Claims, with the understanding that the Committee on Fisheries and "Peace Line" start functioning as soon as possible.

(3) The lists of the Committee members, which are attached hereto, were exchanged between the Chief Delegates of both sides. In connection with the inquiry made by Dr. Sawada as to when the Korean Chief Member of the Committee on Fisheries and "Peace Line" would be nominated, Mr. Limb replied that he would inform the Japanese side of the nomination of the Chief Member as soon as it was made.

(4) It was agreed that the next plenary session be held at 10:30 a.m. on May 14, 1958.

(5) The press release, the text of which is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

65

1662

0179

**Summary Record
of the Ninth Plenary Session
of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks**

1. Date, time and place:

May 14 (Wednesday), 1958 11:00 a.m. - 11:30 a.m.
at Room 411, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japanese
Government

2. Conference:

Korean Delegates

Mr. LIM, Bon G.
Mr. LEE, Ho
Mr. CHOI, Kyu Han

Japanese Delegates

Dr. Renzo SAWADA
Mr. Takajiro INOUE
Mr. Yasuhide KATSUNO
Mr. Kenta HIRAGA
Mr. Wataru OKUMA
Mr. Tokichi TAKANO
Mr. Keijiro SHOJI
Mr. Kazuo AWANAWA

3. Proceedings:

(1) The summary records of the seventh and eighth

/plenary sessions

75

1673

010190

- 2 -

plenary sessions of the Fourth Korea-Japan Overall Talks, which had been respectively initialed by Mr. Choi and Mr. Okuma, have been confirmed by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

(2) Mr. Limb stated that inasmuch as both sides came to conclusion that the works of the Committees on Korean Claims and on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan would start first, he considered it proper to make arrangements for actual starting of these two committees. Mr. Limb proposed that the first meetings of the Committees on Legal Status of Korean Residents in Japan and on Korean Claims would be held on May 19, and 20, 1958, respectively.

(3) Dr. Sawada stated that he had no objection to Mr. Limb's proposal.

(4) It was agreed that the future plenary sessions would be held upon decision by the Chief Delegates of both sides, when necessary.

(5) The press release, the text of which is attached hereto, was decided by the Chief Delegates of both sides.

- The end -

76

1874

0191